

In the United States District Court Eastern District of Pennsylvania

William Ney, Individually and as Executor of the Estate of Loretta Ney,

Plaintiff,

vs.

Owens-Illinois, Inc. Asbestos Corp. Ltd.,

Defendants.

16 2408

Civil Action No.

Formerly No. 1441, March Term, 2014, in the Court of Common Pleas Philadelphia County, PA

FILED

MAY 17 2016

MICHAEL E. KUNZ, Clerk
By Dep Clerk

OWENS-ILLINOIS, INC.'S NOTICE OF REMOVAL

Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. 1332, 1446, Defendant Owens-Illinois, Inc. ("OI") gives notice of removal of this action from the Court of Common Pleas for Philadelphia County, PA to the United States District Court for the Eastern District of Pennsylvania.

GROUNDS FOR REMOVAL

- 1. Removal is proper based on diversity of citizenship.
- 2. On March 11, 2014, Plaintiffs William Ney and Loretta Ney filed this product liability action in the Court of Common Pleas for Philadelphia County styled Loretta Ney and William Ney, Husband and Wife, Plaintiffs v. Asbestos Corporation Limited, et al., Defendants, March Term, 2014, Cause No.

1441 ("Complaint") (Exhibit 1). The Complaint is a "short form" complaint used in state court actions, which incorporates by reference a "Master Long Form Complaint," to allege claims for 1) Negligence and Outrageous Conduct, 2) Strict Liability, 3) Conspiracy, 4) Breach of Warranty, 5) Neighborhood and Household Exposure, and 6) Damages. On December 9, 2014, Plaintiffs amended the Complaint ("Amended Complaint")(Exhibit 2) after Loretta Ney's death to add an additional claim for Wrongful Death.

- The Complaint and Amended Complaint allege that Plaintiff is a resident of the State of North Carolina.
- 4. Plaintiff's Complaint named four defendants that were diverse from Plaintiff.

 One defendant, Crown Cork & Seal Co., Inc., ("Crown"), was a citizen of the

 Commonwealth of Pennsylvania. The inclusion of Crown prevented OI from

 removing the case under 28 U.S.C. §§ 1332 and 1441(b)(2).
- 5. On April 5, 2016, Plaintiff voluntarily dismissed Union Carbide Corporation, and on April 18, 2016, Plaintiff voluntarily dismissed Crown from the case. Stipulations of dismissal as to Union Carbide Corporation and Crown were entered by the Court on April 21, 2016, and May 9, 2016, respectively. As a result, the only remaining defendants are OI and Asbestos Corporation Limited ("ACL") (collectively "Removing Defendants"). Neither OI nor ACL are citizens of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania.
- For diversity purposes, a corporation is deemed to be a citizen of its state of incorporation and the state with its principal place of business. 28 U.S.C. §§ 1332(c)(1).

- a. OI is organized under the laws of the State of Delaware and has
 its principal place of business in Ohio. Affidavit of Susan Gibbons
 (Exhibit 3).
- b. ACL is a Canadian company, with its principal place of business in Canada. (Master Long Form Complaint, Exhibit 4, at ¶ 16.)
- 7. Plaintiff is a citizen of the State of North Carolina.
- 8. The amount in controversy, as stated in plaintiff's state court Complaint, is over \$100,000.00, which exceeds the \$75,000.00 jurisdictional threshold in 28 U.S.C. § 1332 (a).
- 9. This Court has jurisdiction under 28 U.S.C. § 1332 (a)(1) because there is complete diversity between the Plaintiff and Removing Defendants and the case meets the amount in controversy requirements. Thus, removal is proper under 28 U.S.C. § 1441.
- 10. Venue is proper in this Court under 28 U.S.C. § 1391 & 1446(b) because this Court is located in the federal judicial district that includes the Court of Common Pleas for Philadelphia County, PA, where Plaintiff filed the Complaint.
- 11. Under 28 U.S.C. § 1446(b)(3), if the case is not initially removable, a defendant has 30 days after the receipt of an "amended pleading, motion, order, or other paper from which it may first be ascertained that the case is one which is or has become removable." This Notice of Removal satisfies this procedural requirement because OI has filed it within 30 days of Plaintiffs voluntary, April 18, 2016, dismissal of Crown.

- 12. Removal based on diversity must occur within one year after the commencement of the state court action unless the exception in 28 U.S.C. § 1446 (c)(1) or the equitable tolling exception applies. See A.S. ex rel. Miller v. SmithKline Beecham Corp., 769 F.3d 204, 211 (3d Cir. 2014) (holding removal after one year proper if equitable tolling applies). In this case, both exceptions apply. Plaintiffs did not have a valid claim against Crown, but nevertheless joined Crown for the sole purpose of preventing removal. Plaintiffs did not pursue a case against Crown and allowed the one-year time period to expire before voluntarily dismissing Crown. Either 28 U.S.C. § 1446 (c)(1) allows OI to remove the case outside of the one-year time frame or equitable tolling estops Plaintiffs from resisting remand.
- 13. Under 28 U.S.C. § 1446(b)(2)(A), ACL has consented to the Removal of this Action. (Exhibit 5.)
- 14. Under 28 U.S.C. § 1446 (a), OI has filed contemporaneously with this notice a true and correct copy of the process, pleadings, orders, and documents served in this case. (Exhibit 6.)
- 15. Under 28 U.S.C. § 1446 (d), OI has filed contemporaneously with this Notice a copy of the Notice of Removal in the Court of Common Pleas for Philadelphia County, PA.
- 16. By filing this Notice of Removal, OI does not waive any defenses that may be available to it.

WHEREFORE, Defendant Owens-Illinois, Inc. respectfully requests that this action be removed from the Court of Common Pleas for Philadelphia

County, PA to the United States District Court for the Eastern District of Pennsylvania under the authority in 28 U.S.C. § 1441(a).

Respectfully submitted,

MCCARTER & ENGLISH, LLP

Barbara K. Gotthelf, No. 53832 McCARTER & ENGLISH, LLP

Attorneys for Defendant OWENS-ILLINOIS, INC.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned certifies that on this 17th day of May, 2016, a true and correct copy of Owens-Illinois, Inc.'s Notice of Removal was served upon all counsel of record, per the attached counsel list, via ECF and electronic mail.

/s/ Barbara K. Gotthelf
Barbara K. Gotthelf, No. 53832
McCARTER & ENGLISH, LLP
Attorneys for Defendant
OWENS-ILLINOIS, INC.



Loretta Ney v. O-I, et al.

SERVICE LIST

Jacqueline Gruhler, Esq.

COHEN/PLACITELLA/ROTH, P.C.

Two Commerce Square

2001 Market Street, Suite 2900

Philadelphia, PA 19103

(215)-567-3500

(215)-567-6019 (fax)

igruhler@cprlaw.com

Attorney(s) for Plaintiff

Bernard Levinthal, Esq.
Janet E. Golup Esq.
Nancy DeBasio
GOLDFEIN & JOSEPH
1880 JFK Blvd., 20th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19103
(215)-979-8200
(215)-979-8201 (fax)
blevinthal@goldfeinlaw.com
igolup@goldfeinlaw.com
ndebasio@goldfeinlaw.com
Attorney(s) for Asbestos Corporation Limited

Case 5: 6 cv-02408-ER Document 1 Filed 05/17/16 Pag 58 of 10 - W- 2408

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the number of initiating the civil docket sheet. (SEE INSTRUCTIONS ON MEXT PAGE OF THIS FORM.)

	locker sheet. ASER INSTRUCTIONS ON NEXT FAIL		FENDANTS	a A	GANG
I. (a) PLAINTIFFS		-	FENDANTS	16	2408
WILLIAM NEY, individually and as Executor of the Estate of DORETTA			ENS-ILLINOIS, I		
14151		AS	BESTOS CORP. I	LTD.	
	of First Listed Plaintiff Forsyth County, NC	Cou	inty of Residence	of First Listed Defendant	/Wood County, OH
(E.	XCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES)	NOT	r'F-	(IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES IN LAND CONDEMNATION	CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF
		l no.		THE TRACT OF LAND IN	DLVED.
(c) Attorneys (Firm Name,	Address, and Telephone Number)	Att	orneys (If Known) bara K. Gotthelf, I	*****	
Jacquelme P. Gruhler, Cohen, Placitella & R	Esq. oth, P.C. rc, 2001 Market St., Suite 2900	/ McC	Carter & English,	Lar	
Two Commerce Squa Philadelphia, PA 191	re, 2001 Market St., Suite 2900	Phil	0 Market Street, S adelphia, PA 191	uite 3900 03	
Philadelphia, PA 191- 215-567-3500		215	-979-3836		
II. BASIS OF JURISD	ICTION (Place an "X" in One Box Only)		ersity Cases Only) 🗻	~	Place an "X" in One Box for Plaintiff and One Box for Defendant)
U.S. Government	Federal Question (U.S. Government Not a Party)	Citizen of This	P T	F DEF	Principal Place
ſ	, //			of Business In	_ /_/
2 U.S. Government Defendant	■ 4 Diversity (Indicate Citizenship of Parties in Item III)	Citizen of And	other State	2 1 2 Incorporated and of Business In	/ Principal Place 5 State
		Citizen or Sub	ject of a	3 Foreign Nation	
		Foreign Co.			
IV. NATURE OF SUIT		the second trans			- CHAIR STATUTES
☐ 110 Insurance	PERSONAL INJURY PERSONAL INJ	ment of the second of the seco	elated Seizure	BANKRUPTCY ☐ 422 Appeal 28 USC 158	☐ 375 False Claims Act
120 Marine	☐ 310 Airplane ☐ 365 Personal Injur	ry - of Prop		423 Withdrawal	400 State Reapportionment
130 Miller Act 140 Negotiable Instrument	☐ 315 Airplane Product Product Liability ☐ 367 Health Care/	ility 690 Other		28 USC 157	410 Antitrust 430 Banks and Banking
☐ 150 Recovery of Overpayment	320 Assault, Libel & Pharmaceutics		'	PROPERTY RIGHTS	450 Commerce 460 Deportation
& Enforcement of Judgment 151 Medicarc Act	Slander Personal Injur 330 Federal Employers Product Liabil			820 Copyrights 830 Patent	470 Racketeer Influenced and
☐ 151 Medicare Act ☐ 152 Recovery of Defaulted ☐ Student Loans	Liability S 36 Asbestos Pers Injury Produc			840 Trademark	Corrupt Organizations 480 Consumer Credit
(Excludes Veterans)	☐ 345 Marine Product Liability	,A 1.	ABOR	SOCIAL SECURITY	490 Cable/Sat TV
153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits	Liability PERSONAL PROF	PERTY 710 Fair La	bor Standards	□861 HIA (1395ff) □862 Black Lung (923)	850 Securities/Commodities/ Exchange
☐ 160 Stockholders' Suits	355 Motor Vehicle 371 Truth in Lend	ing 720 Labor/	Management	☐ 863 DIWC/DIWW (405(g)) ☐ 864 SSID Title XVI	890 Other Statutory Actions
☐ 190 Other Contract ☐ 195 Contract Product Liability	Product Liability 380 Other Persona 360 Other Personal Property Dame	age 740 Railway	y Labor Act	865 RSI (405(g))	891 Agricultural Acts 893 Environmental Matters
☐ 196 Franchise	Injury 385 Property Dam 362 Personal Injury Product Liabil				895 Freedom of Information Act
	Medical Malpractice	790 Other L	abor Litigation		896 Arbitration 899 Administrative Procedure
REAL PROPERTY 210 Land Condemnation	CIVIL RIGHTS PRISON REPETIT 440 Other Civil Rights Habeas Corpus:			FFDERAL TAX SULIS 870 Taxes (U.S. Plaintiff	Act/Review or Appeal of
220 Foreclosure	441 Voting 463 Alien Detained	in the second se	1	or Defendant) 871 IRS—Third Party	Agency Decision 950 Constitutionality of
240 Torts to Land	443 Housing/ Sentence	icato	ľ	26 USC 7609	State Statutes
245 Tort Product Liability 290 All Other Real Property	Accommodations 530 General 445 Amer, w/Disabilities 535 Death Penalty	INIMATO	RATION		S
,	Employment Other:	☐462 Natural	ization Application		· ·
	☐ 446 Amer. w/Disabilities ☐ 540 Mandamus & Other ☐ 550 Civil Rights	Other 465 Other In			\$:
	☐ 448 Education ☐ 555 Prison Conditi		ili ili		V.0
	Conditions of				W
V. ORIGIN Place an "X" in	Confinement				
☐ 1 Original \ 🖄 2 Ren	noved from 3 Remanded from	☐4 Reinstated or		ferred from 🔲 6 Multidi	
Proceeding Stat	e Court Appellate Court	Reopened	Anoth (specif)	er District Litigati	on .
NA CARREDOS	Cite the U.S. Civil Statute under which you a	are filing (Do not cite)	urisdictional statute	s unless diversity):	***************************************
VI. CAUSE OF ACTION	28 USC 1332 Brief description of cause:		2002201-00-00-00-00-00-00-00-00-00-00-00-00-0		
	injuries suffered from alleged household exp				
VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT:	UNDER RULE 23, F.R.Cv.P.	N DEMAND	S	JURY DEMAND	y if demanded in complaint: : ⊠Yes □ No
VIII. RELATED CASE		**************************************			
IF ANY	(See instructions): JUDGE			DOCKET NUMBER	9.2
DATE		TORNEY OF RECORD	1)	e Bronz.	MAY 49 ALL
05/17/2016	/s/ Barbara K. Go		KRUITA	U	MAY 17 2016
FOR OFFICE USE ONLY			7	The same and the s	b
· BEAUTION II	CALIFER A DISTANCE FOR		mode	MAG HE	TVCE

02408-ER Document 1 Filed 05/17/16 Page 9 of 10
CIVIL COVER SHEET

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither reptace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Addicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. (She INSTRUCTIONS ON NEXT FAGE OF THIS FORM.)

L. (a) PLAINTIFFS

I. (a) PLAINTIFFS	WORLD STOCK 12005 MAD MALE			DEFENDANTS)	16	24	08
WILLIAM NEY, individually and as Executor of the Estate of DORETTA NEY			OWENS-ILLINOIS, INC., ASBESTOS CORP. LTD.					
	of First Listed Plaintiff FAXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF C		e salamanika erit a a 12 - temper e	County of Residence	e of First Listed Defen (IN U.S. PLAINTIFF IN LAND CONDEMN THE TRACT OF LAN	CASES ONLY	es, use the lo)
Jacqueline P. Gruhler,	Address, and Telephone Numb Esq. oth, P.C. re, 2001 Market St., Suite 2	₩ 1V 1V		Attorneys (If Kuawn) Barbara K. Gotthelf, McCarter & English 1600 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19 215-979-3836	159 LLP Suite 3900 103			
II. BASIS OF JURISD	ICTION (Place an "X" in	One Box Only)	III. CIT	IZENSHIP OF PR	INCIPAL PART	TES (Place a	nn "X" in One Box nd One Box for De	for Plaintiff Gendant)
U.S. Government Plaintiff	Federal Question (U.S. Government No.	t a Party)	Citiz	(For Diversity Cases Only) en of This State	DEF DEF Incorpor of But	nted or Princip siness In This S	PT oal Place □	
2 U.S. Government Defendant	☑ 4 Diversity Indicate Citizenship	of Parties in Item III)		en of Subject of a		ated <i>and</i> Princ siness In Anoth Nation		5
	\ · /			rigign Country	<i>y</i> =	······································	***************************************	5.5000)))pan, yy, ydnio yyru 1900
IV. NATURE OF SUIT)alyj					OTHER STA	Z Piveston
110 Insurance 120 Marine 130 Miller Act 140 Negotiable Instrument 150 Recovery of Overpayment & Enforcement of Judgment 151 Medicare Act 152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loans (Excludes Veterans) 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits 160 Stockholders' Suits 190 Other Contract 195 Contract Product Liability 196 Franchise REAL PROPERTY 210 Land Condemnation 220 Forcelosure 230 Rent Lease & Ejectment 240 Torts to Land 245 Tort Product Liability 290 All Other Real Property	PERSONAL INJURY 310 Airplane 315 Airplane Product Liability 320 Assault, Libel &	PERSONAL INJI 365 Personal Injur Product Liabii 367 Health Care/ Pharmaceutica Personal Injur Product Liabiii 368 Asbestos Personal Injury Product Liabiii 369 Asbestos Personal Injury Product Liability PERSONAL PROP 370 Other Fraud 371 Truth in Lendi 380 Other Personal Property Dama Product Liabili 618 Only R. PETTI Habeas Corpus: 463 Alien Detainee 510 Motions to Vac Sentence 530 General 5315 Death Penalty Other:	URY 66 y - 69 il / (ity) 69 il / (ity) 79 il 72 il 74 il 79 il 79 cate 74 date 74	25 Drug Related Seizure of Property 21 USC 881 20 Other LABOR 0 Fair Labor Standards Act 10 Labor/Management Relations 10 Railway Labor Act 11 Family and Medical Leave Act 10 Other Labor Litigation 11 Employee Retirement 1 Income Security Act 1 MMIGRATION 2 Naturalization Application 5 Other Immigration Actions	422 Appeal 28 USC 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 157 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 157 424 USC 157 425 USC 1609 425 USC	158	375 False Claims 400 State Reappe 410 Antitrust 430 Banks and B 450 Commerce 460 Deportation 470 Racketeer Int Corrupt Orga 480 Consumer Ct 490 Cable/Sat TV 850 Securities/Cc Exchange 890 Other Statuto 891 Agricultural 893 Environment 895 Freedom of I Act 896 Arbitration 899 Administrativ Act/Review of Agency Decis 950 Constitutiona State Statutes	Act ortionment anking fluenced and nizations redii / ormadities/ ory Actions Acts all Matters information // e Procedure or Appeal of sign lity of [1]
		560 Civil Detainee Conditions of Confinement	•				***************************************	T
	toved from 🔲 3 Rem	anded from eliate Court			her District	Multidistrict Litigation		
VI. CAUSE OF ACTION	28 USC 1332 Brief description of caus	C:		not cite jurisdictional statu	ies uniess diversity);	All Million and Committee		
VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT:	injuries suffered from a CHECK IF THIS IS UNDER RULE 23,	A CLASS ACTION	1	estos EMAND Š	CHECK YI JURY DEI	· · · · · · ·	manded in com	olaint: No
VIII. RELATED CASE IF ANY	(S) (See instructions);	JUDGE			DOCKET NUMB	ER		22 1 22 1
DATE 05/17/2016		SIGNATURE OF ATT /s/ Barbara K. Got	23	HECORD PLANETO	4	M	AY 17	2016
FOR OFFICE USE ONLY RECEIPT # AMO	DUNT	APPLYING IFP		JUDGE	· M	AG. JUDGE		



IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

Telephone	FAX Number	E-Mail Address	,
215-979-3836	215-988-4308	bgotthelf@mccarter.com	
Date	Attorney-at-law	Attorney for	
May 17, 2016	Freday Sarah	Def. Owens-Illinois, Inc.	
(f) Standard Managemen	t - Cases that do not fall into	any one of the other tracks.	()
the court. (See revers management cases.)	e side of this form for a detail	ed explanation of special	()
	- Cases that do not fall into tr	acks (a) through (d) that are call or intense management by	
(d) Asbestos – Cases invo exposure to asbestos.	olving claims for personal inju	ry or property damage from	(x)
(c) Arbitration - Cases re	quired to be designated for ar	bitration under Local Civil Rule 53.	.2. ()
(b) Social Security - Case and Human Services of	es requesting review of a deci lenying plaintiff Social Secur	sion of the Secretary of Health ity Benefits.	()
(a) Habeas Corpus – Case	es brought under 28 U.S.C. §	2241 through § 2255.	()
SELECT ONE OF THE	FOLLOWING CASE MAN	AGEMENT TRACKS:	
plaintiff shall complete a filing the complaint and se side of this form.) In the designation, that defendant the plaintiff and all other	Case Management Track Des erve a copy on all defendants. e event that a defendant doe nt shall, with its first appearar	ay Reduction Plan of this court, co- ignation Form in all civil cases at the (See § 1:03 of the plan set forth on the s not agree with the plaintiff regard ace, submit to the clerk of court and track Designation Form specifying igned.	e time of e reverse ding said serve on
OWENS-ILLINOIS, INC. ASBESTOS CORP. LTD.	: / \	16 2	240
V.	K	10 0) 1 0
WILLIAM NEY, individually a Estaté of LORETTA NEY	i A	CIVIL ACTION	

(Civ. 660) 10/02